School lab injuries on rise

More hands-on science and lack of safety training prove a dangerous combination.

TAMMY WEBBER
GENOA — In a blinding flash, the routine high school chemistry experiment turned to chaos.

An alcohol-fueled fireball shot into the classroom, searing the skin of three junior honor students in the front row. They took the brunt of the blast on their faces, necks, arms, hands and legs.

The teacher pulled burning jeans off one of the girls; scorched skin fell from a boy’s face. The rest of the class scrambled for the door, leaving burned backpacks and books behind.

The fire at Genoa-Kingston High School in October may have been a horrible accident, but it was not isolated. Nationwide, at least 150 students have been seriously injured in school laboratory accidents during the past four years.

But the number is almost certainly much higher, according to interviews with researchers, school officials and insurance companies. And the stage is set for a significant increase, they said.

Area schools take precautions to prevent accidents. Teachers get specialized training. They attend seminars and learn how to properly demonstrate an experiment, and students take quizzes about safety at the beginning of each school year.

The schools also require students to tie back hair, wear aprons and goggles, and roll up their sleeves.

“It’s important to be observant in class,” said Rockford Christian Junior High School science teacher Allen Steely. “The teacher should be walking around the classroom and looking from every direction at what’s going on.”

Hononegah High School physics teacher John Carleton agrees.

“A lot has to do with room design, as well,” said Carleton, who’s been at Hononegah for 22 years. “You have to stand there and keep your eye on the students. Where stuff tends to happen is when you’re working with one group of students, it means another group of students is to your back.”

Neither school has had any recent serious accidents.
New standards

As schools try to meet tough new science education standards set by the National Academy of Sciences in 1996, students spend more time in laboratories. Some are crowded. Some have teachers with no safety training. Some are in 19th-century buildings ill-equipped for 21st-century science.

“Before, most kids were reading out of textbooks, but the new federal science standards absolutely strongly advocate hands-on, inquiry-based science,” said Kenneth Roy, chairman of the National Science Teachers Association’s science safety advisory board. “What this means is, you have to have safety concerns as job one, but some schools don’t.”

Almost all school lab accidents and injuries could be prevented with simple safety measures, the experts said. But many teachers are unaware of the dangers, and there is no formal system to distribute information about accidents so teachers can learn from others’ mistakes.

In fact, no government or private agency collects official data on school laboratory accidents. Federal and state workplace laws protect teachers and other employees and require extensive reporting. But students have no such protections. As a result, the exact number of accidents is unknown.

But they occur often enough to be considered a serious problem, according to safety experts and insurers who have paid millions of dollars to settle claims.

“There have been some terrible accidents and injuries that are just absolutely gross,” said John Wilson, executive director of the Schools Excess Liability Fund in California, which recently paid more than $1 million in a case involving a chemistry accident and more than $3 million in another.

A settlement is pending in a third accident involving a Riverside, Calif., girl who was burned over 20 percent of her body. She is undergoing treatment to reduce scarring and improve the use of her badly burned right arm.

There is evidence that the number of accidents has risen since schools began adopting the new teaching standards. In Iowa, there were 674 accidents during the 1990, 1991 and 1992 school years, but more than 1,000 in the next three school years, said Jack Gerlovich, who teaches science safety at Drake University.

The increase came after Iowa schools began adopting an early version of the new standards, he said. The number of lawsuits soared, too, to 245 from 96. Gerlovich said he suspects the same thing is happening in other states.

“The potential for accidents is much, much greater, and we’re going to see more. I think this was the tip of an iceberg,” Gerlovich said.
“It would be eye-opening if reliable statistics were available. I think the actual numbers would be much, much higher, but it’s the kind of problem nobody wants to face.”

Volatile experiments

When the swoosh of fire hit Autumn Burton, she was returning to her seat in her chemistry class after taking a closer look at the colors of the flames in the six petri dishes on the teacher’s table.

In an instant, she was engulfed in flames.

“I could feel it eating at me, and I could smell my skin burning,” she recalled. “I was on the floor trying to get it off with my hands.”

By the time someone finally managed to wrap her in a blanket and put out the fire, she was burned over almost half her body: face, neck, chest, arms and legs.

Burton, now 19, attends Columbia College in Chicago. Despite eight skin-graft operations and three laser treatments to diminish facial scarring, she will be disfigured for life.

The accident happened two years ago at Lakeview High School in Battle Creek, Mich. Two months earlier, a 16-year-old girl was severely burned in a similar accident 40 miles away at Waverly High School near Lansing. In both cases, the experiments involved methyl alcohol.

A volatile chemical that ignites easily, methyl alcohol often is involved in the most catastrophic accidents. In recent years, it also has caused flash fires at schools in Santa Clarita and Riverside, Calif.; Genoa; Midland, Texas; New Berlin, Wis.; and Washington, D.C. It also has caused explosions in which students were injured by flying glass.

If a teacher does not use an exhaust system, leaves the cap off the alcohol jug or pours too much into the dishes, fumes can build up and, if exposed to flame, create a flash fire. If the fumes come from an open bottle, the explosion can eject the liquid, followed by a ball of fire.

“You get a flame-thrower effect,” said Steve Weston, a lawyer representing Burton and the student from Lansing. “It jettisons fluid from the bottle, whose opening is pointed like a gun right at these students.”

The fire marshal in Battle Creek determined Burton’s accident could have been prevented if an exhaust system in the room had been used to draw fumes. And the injuries might have been minimized if the teacher had used a plastic shield or required the students to wear goggles.
Lack of training

In many cases, school officials thought such protection was unnecessary when students were watching, rather than participating in, an experiment — even though most states have laws requiring eye protection under such circumstances.

But a high percentage of science teachers have never had safety training. In some cases, the schools didn’t even own the necessary safety equipment, experts said.

Gerlovich, the Drake University researcher, has found, for example, that more than 70 percent of North Carolina science teachers never received safety training. Surveys in 17 other states found an average of 55 percent to 65 percent of teachers have never been trained in safety, Gerlovich said.

Alan Paradise, assistant principal of East Bakersfield High School in California, said he never imagined students were in serious jeopardy in chemistry labs until a glass bottle of methanol exploded three years ago, sending a teacher and 22 students to hospitals with cuts, headaches and nausea. After that, the district began requiring the use of shields and goggles and sent teachers to safety training.

“We had done this demonstration for years and years without problems,” Paradise said. “We’re not teaching because we want to hurt people, but we were really lucky. We’re fortunate nothing worse happened.”

The lack of training is alarming for another reason, experts said: Many teachers don’t know how to safely store chemicals, which can cause dangerous reactions if they accidentally mix. Some teachers erroneously store chemicals alphabetically instead of by chemical type or store them beyond their safe life span.

In Rogersville, Tenn., in March, old and unlabeled bottles of chemicals being removed from a high school accidentally leaked and mixed, causing an explosion and fire. No one was hurt.

In Valley, Neb., officials cleaning out a school lab last year found a canister of picric acid, which crystallizes and becomes highly explosive with age. When they realized that it was about 30 years old, they called a bomb squad, which blew up the canister.

After the flash

Nine months after the Genoa-Kingston flash fire, Rachel Anderson, Eric Baenziger and Kara Butts still are recovering from their burns. Kara and Eric wear pressure garments 24 hours a day to reduce scarring, and both will require skin grafts, said their lawyer, Michael Alesia. The students declined to be interviewed for this story.

All eventually returned to school. Administrators are trying to sort out what happened and whether they should change their chemistry procedures. The teacher was not
disciplined and remains on staff, according to the school’s superintendent, Richard Leahy. The teacher did not respond to a request for an interview, but Leahy said, “No one agonized more than this man over hurting his students. He’s a retired professional chemist; he teaches because he loves it.”

The Genoa-Kingston case illustrates a lack of school safety oversight common in most states, where laws, if they exist, are almost never enforced in schools. Aside from eye protection requirements, few laws are aimed specifically at students. School labs rarely undergo inspections from state or federal authorities and usually there are no requirements that accidents be reported to anyone outside the school.

“The schools are pretty much left on their own,” said James A. Kaufman, director of the Massachusetts-based Laboratory Safety Institute, a nonprofit agency that promotes school lab safety. “They all assume these are smart people, they have a science degree, they know how to do this properly. This is not true in some significant measure.”

Gaps in OSHA

Federal Occupational Safety and Health Administration rules do not cover municipal or state employees, and in most states, similar workplace safety laws apply only to employees. There is no OSHA equivalent to protect students. Instead, it is assumed that if laws — including OSHA’s laboratory standards — protect teachers, students also will be safe, experts said.

The Illinois Labor Department, for example, investigates school accidents only if someone reports them, said Al Juskenas, the department’s manager of safety inspection and education. But schools only are required to report accidents if someone is killed, or if three or more employees — not students — are injured seriously enough to go to the hospital.

The department investigated the Genoa-Kingston case because a teacher complained, he said.

The Illinois Board of Education suggests guidelines for science laboratory safety but has no power to enforce them, said Gwen Pollock, the board’s science education consultant. The state fire marshal’s office, which investigated the Genoa-Kingston accident, has no power to enforce lab safety either, officials there said.

“I think lawmakers need to take another look at things,” said Roy of the National Science Teachers Association.

“But there is a lot on the books now that needs to be enforced, and teachers need training. You send your kids to school because you think they’re safe. It burns me that accidents are happening when they’re preventable.”

Register Star reporter Anna Voelker contributed to this report.